|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | From (email) | date | Selection | Comment |
| 1 | [Philip.Carlisle@HistoricEngland.org.uk](mailto:Philip.Carlisle@HistoricEngland.org.uk) | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 2 | [jim.salmons@factminers.org](mailto:jim.salmons@factminers.org) | 4/1/2018 | (A) | - |
| 3 | richard@light.demon.co.uk | 4/1/2018 | - | Forgive me if I'm commenting out of turn, through not having been involved in a discussion, but I thought that our convention is to express it as simply "P73 has translation (is translation of)" in the CRM definition text, and:  P73 has translation => P73i is translation of in the RDF instantiation of the CRM. |
| 4 | c.e.s.ore@iln.uio.no | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 5 | p.m.van.leusen@rug.nl | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 6 | RSanderson@getty.edu | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 7 | smiragli@uwm.edu | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 8 | lister@oeide.no | 4/1/2018 | A | - |
| 9 | patrick.le-boeuf@bnf.fr | 5/1/2018 | - | In my opinion, A and B are not just two alternative labels for one property, between which we have to choose; they actually correspond to two distinct properties. A corresponds to the most common case, in which we know precisely which is the "original" text, and which is the "translated" one. But B corresponds to a different situation, in which all we know is that two texts convey the same conceptual content and that most probably one is the translation of the other, but we do not know precisely which, either for lack of historical knowledge (you may find examples in the IFLA list of Anonymous Classics, < <https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/pubs/anonymous-classics_2004.pdf>>), or because there is a political or legal motivation for regarding various linguistic expressions of a given content as perfectly equivalent (official texts of multilingual countries, such as Switzerland, or Canada; or supranational organizations, such as the European Union, IFLA, or ISO). I leave it to Martin to decide whether we should have two distinct properties or not: - P73 has translation (is translation of) / P73i is translation of (has translation) [a shortcut for a "long path" through an event that can be instantiated] - Pn has other equivalent linguistic rendition [a symmetric property, and definitely not a shortcut: it is impossible to instantiate the translation activity; it has necessarily existed, but we don't know whether it happened from domain to range or from range to domain]. |